

**FORT SMITH HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MAY 2, 2024, 5:30 P.M.
DARBY COMMUNITY CENTER, 220 NORTH 7TH STREET**

AGENDA

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ROLL CALL

III. STATEMENT OF QUALIFICATIONS

IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – APRIL 4, 2024

V. CITIZENS FORUM

VI. PUBLIC HEARING

- A. Historic Name: Edgar Brown Jr. House Owner: Luis Ibarra
 Construction Date: c. 1895 Style Influence: Queen Anne/Eastlake
 Address: 515 North 5th Street Significance: (1) Very Significant
- Repair and replace front porch, steps, and walkway.

VII. COMMISSION DISCUSSION – LETTER TO BOARD OF DIRECTORS IN REGARD TO UDO AMENDMENT FOR THE ADDITION OF DISPLACED YOUTH HOUSING LAND USE IN THE RH ZONE

VIII. NEXT MEETING DATES

Study Session – May 30, 2024 – 5:30 pm
Regular Meeting – June 6, 2024 - 5:30 pm

IX. ADJOURN

FORT SMITH HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION STATEMENT OF QUALIFICATIONS AND PROCEDURES

Good evening. It is 5:30 p.m. and the _____, 2024, regular meeting of the Fort Smith Historic District Commission is called to order.

Morghan, will you please call the roll?

It is established that a quorum is present.

If anyone this evening wishes to address an agenda item or present any matter of business that is not on the agenda during the Citizens Forum, you may do so by completing one of the appropriate forms that are placed on the table next to you and giving it to our staff person, Morghan Barnhill. Those wishing to address agenda items or bring up any matter during the Citizens Forum will be allotted two (2) minutes. Those persons addressing controversial agenda items will be allotted five (5) minutes per side with three (3) minutes for rebuttal per side.

This evening the Commission will be reviewing requests for exterior changes to properties in the Belle Grove Historic District.

The qualifications of the members of the Commission, the staff of the Commission, and any consultants used are on file with the city and are hereby made a part of each and every application heard this evening. The guidelines and procedures adopted by the Commission are also made a part of each and every application. Each application heard this evening is considered on its own merits and is not to be considered as establishing a precedent for any other application.

Any person aggrieved by the decision of the Commission may within ten (10) days of the date of decision file a written request with the Commission that the Commission forward to the Fort Smith Board of Directors a written report summarizing the actions taken by the Commission with reference to the application in question.

Voting Procedures

Chairman: Introduce the item

Staff: Presents the item

Chairman: Asks for those wishing to speak in support, then asks for those wishing to speak in opposition. Note: Planning Commission does not “debate” the issue at this time.

Chairman: Following presentations by staff and comments by the public, the chairman asks for a (main) motion. Motions should be in the positive not the negative. Examples: I move to Approve as submitted or I move to approve with staff comments.

Chairman: Asks for discussion on the main motion.

Planning Commission: Discussion, questions and debate by the planning commission. It is very helpful if the Planning Commission articulate why they are voting on an item and especially if voting against the motion to approve.

Chairman: Following Planning commission discussion, the chairman asks for any amendments. If there are any amendments then a motion to amend and a second is required. Ask for discussion on the motion to amend. Then vote on the amendments and if the amendments are approved, then;

Chairman: Calls for a vote on the amended main motion, or
If the main motion was not amended then vote on the main motion.

and Mr. Lodes responded that he currently did not. Commissioner Duke asked if the material was in planks and Mr. Lodes responded that it was 8 inches tall and 12 feet long. Commissioner Clock asked if the material was wood grain and Mr. Lodes confirmed that it was. Mr. Lodes clarified that the material would be installed like traditional siding and seams would not be visible. Chairman Masur asked Mr. Lodes if the current siding was vinyl and he responded that it was asbestos siding with wood underneath. Chairman Masur asked Mr. Lodes if he was going to remove the wood siding that was underneath and how much of the structure would have siding replaced. He responded that the hardie board would go on top of a vapor barrier and the wooden siding would remain underneath. He clarified that siding would be replaced on the entire structure.

Commissioner Deason asked Mr. Lodes if he would be replacing the trim on the windows in accordance with the siding. Mr. Lodes responded that the trim would not be changed and would remain intact.

Ms. Barnhill read the staff report and recommended approval of the item, citing that hardie board was an approved substitute material from the National Park Service as well as the Secretary of the Interior.

Chairman Masur called for a motion. Commissioner Duke moved, seconded by Commissioner Kraus to approve. Chairman Masur called for a vote. The vote was 3 in favor and 1 abstention. (Clock)

VII. COMMISSION INPUT – UNIFIED DEVELOPMENT ORDINANCE

Tyler Miller, Senior Planner, introduced the Unified Development Ordinance amendment that would be presented at the April 9th Planning Commission meeting and asked for the Historic District Commission's input on the proposed land use for Displaced Youth Housing, specifically in the Residential Historic zone.

The Commission cited several concerns, including age range, occupancy maximum, enforcement, safety, traffic, and parking. Several neighboring property owners were present with the same concerns.

Mr. Miller responded that the proposed land use would require conditional use approval in the allowed zoning districts and each application would have site specific requirements. He explained that the Planning Commission would only be voting on adding the definition to the UDO and as a land use to several different zoning districts, including RH, requiring conditional use approval.

The Commission noted that they were not in support of the land use being added to the RH zone and asked Mr. Miller what the next steps would be.

Mr. Miller responded that the Planning Commission would review the item at the April 9th Planning Commission meeting and the Board of Directors would review the item at their May 7th meeting. He stated that any of the members of the Historic District Commission as well as neighboring property owners were welcome to attend both public hearings.

The meeting adjourned at approximately 6:15 p.m.

APPROVED: _____
Mila Masur, Chairman



Belle Grove Historic District

c/o City of Fort Smith Planning Dept.
P.O. Box 1908 or 623 Garrison Ave., Rm 331
Fort Smith, AR 72902

Certificate of Appropriateness Application Form

(please use blue or black ink only)

PROPERTY LOCATION

Historic Name of Property Luis A Ibarra

Address 515 N 5 St

Lot Number _____

Block Number _____

OWNER

Name Luis A Ibarra

Address 1711 N I St Phone 479 719 1962

PERSON FILING APPLICATION, IF OTHER THAN OWNER

Name _____

Address _____ Phone _____

BUILDING DATA

Construction Date: _____

Type of Construction: Wood Frame _____ Brick _____ Stone _____ Other _____

Original Use:

Single Family Residential X

Multi-Family Residential _____

Hotel/Boarding House _____

Office _____

Commercial/Retail _____

Industrial _____

Vacant _____

Combined Uses _____

Other _____

Luisibarra 042@gmail.com.

name Luis A Ibarra.

CONCISE DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED WORK: (Attach additional papers if necessary)

Paint exterior of home (has already been done)
Repair front steps and walk way
Trim- White Siding- looks to be clearspring green
by Benjamin Moore

PROJECT ARCHITECT/ENGINEER:

Name _____

Address _____
Phone _____

MINOR WORK APPROVAL

_____ staff _____ date

Upon being signed and dated above by the Planning Director or designee, this application becomes the Minor Work Certificate of Appropriateness. It is valid until _____. Issuance of a Minor Work Certificate shall not relieve the applicant, contractor, tenant, or property owner from obtaining any other permit required by City code or any law. Minor work projects not approved by staff will be forwarded to the Certificate of Appropriateness Committee for review at its next meeting.

CATEGORIES OF MINOR WORK

- (A) Emergency, temporary maintenance and repair which does not permanently alter the distinctive features of the subject building, structure or property, all required City of Fort Smith permits are obtained, and the owner of the property commits to apply for a certificate of appropriateness to make permanent repairs within thirty (30) days of the date on which the administrative staff grants written approval of the emergency, temporary repair;
- (B) The installation of HVAC equipment that is located in the rear or on the side of the property and is entirely screened from public view with wood lattice panels or plantings;
- (C) The installation of electrical and telephone panels, cable connections, satellite dishes, gas meters, or window air conditioning units that are located on a building's rear facade;
- (D) The installation of a roof ventilation device not larger than twelve inches height and located

on the rear of the building's roof;

(E) The installation of a privacy fence that is made of wood with flat boards in a single row, no taller than six feet, located in the rear of the property and set back from the building's front facade at least one-half the distance between the front facade and the property's rear property line;

(F) Installation of a picket fence that is made of wood, no taller than three (3) feet, with pickets no wider than four (4) inches and spacing between pickets of not more than three (3) inches, and painted white or neutral color;

(G) Removal of a chain link fence;

(H) Installation of storm windows that match the design, configuration, and color of the existing windows;

(I) Repair and replacement of a sidewalk or driveway on public and private property that does not involve a change in size material, and location;

(J) The construction, replacement, or repair of a public street or alley; and,

(K) The painting of or installation of shingles on the roof of any building or structure provided the paint colors or shingle color is consistent with the Commission's adopted list of approved paint and shingle colors for use within the historic district.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Please include the following items that are application specific:

On Existing Buildings:

- COMPLETE THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION FORM
- CURRENT COLOR PHOTOGRAPH OF EXISTING APPEARANCE OF STRUCTURE showing its present condition and the existing materials, colors, and textures.
- ELEVATION DRAWINGS- Dimensional drawings of all elevations showing proposed exterior architectural changes.
- PAINT SAMPLES required when changing color. Provide manufacturer's samples or samples of actual paint. Indicate manufacturer's name and the name of the color.
- SIDING SAMPLE- Provide a piece of the siding or a manufacturer's brochure showing a picture of the siding and indicating the specifications.
- WINDOWS- indicate window frame material- wood, vinyl or aluminum- indicate size and style.
- SHINGLES- Provide a sample of the shingle and manufacturer's name and color of the shingle.
- OTHER EXTERIOR DETAIL NOT LISTED ABOVE. Provide sample of the detail along with the

manufacturer's name and specifications.

On New Construction:

- COMPLETE THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION FORM.
- SITE PLAN OF PROPERTY (Recommended scale: 1 inch= 20 feet) Include location of all structures and outside equipment (trash, mechanical, common mail boxes, walls, fences, external lighting fixtures, existing and proposed structures, etc.) Show parking areas, driveways, walks, and other hard surface areas. Indicate on the site plan, materials to be used. A surveyed drawing of the perimeter of the lot(s) is required for all Category III applications that involve a change of footprint.
- ELEVATION DRAWINGS- Dimensional drawings of all exterior elevations. Show textures, architectural details and materials. An additional drawing showing landscaping is desirable. (Recommended Scale: at least 1/4 inch = 1foot).
- PAINT SAMPLES required when changing color. Provide manufacturer's sample or samples of actual paint. Indicate manufacturer's name and the name of the color.
- SIDING SAMPLE- Provide a piece of the siding or a manufacturer's brochure showing a picture of the siding and indicating the specifications.
- WINDOWS- indicate window frame material- wood, vinyl, or aluminum- indicate size and style.
- SHINGLES- Provide a sample of the shingle and the manufacturer's name and color of the shingle.
- OTHER EXTERIOR DETAIL NOT LISTED ABOVE. Provide sample of the detail along with the manufacturer's name and specifications.

Certificates of Appropriateness are effective immediately upon issuance. Any work done outside the scope of the Certificates of Appropriateness renders it null and void.

I hereby certify I am the owner, agent of the owner, or other person in control of the property and that the information given herein, and as shown on the application and Certificate of Appropriateness, is true and that I am authorized to obtain this Certificate of Appropriateness. I understand that if the construction and/or installation for which this Certificate of Appropriateness is issued, is contrary to the requirements of city codes or regulations, violations must be corrected. Approval by the Historic District Commission does not excuse the applicant, owner or agent from compliance with any other applicable codes, ordinances or policies of the City of Fort Smith unless expressly stated by the Commission or its staff.

Upon approval of commission, all applicants must purchase a permit from the City Building Inspector.

Penalties: Violation of the ordinance constitute a misdemeanor, and violators upon being found guilty shall be fined not less than \$10 nor more than \$500. Each day that a violation continues to exist shall constitute a separate offense**. (Reference State Act 14-172-204)

** (If cited for violation, applicant may appeal in court)

SIGNATURE OF APPLICANT _____



(Date)

The Planning Department will mail notices of hearing on all Certificate of Appropriateness applications to adjacent property owners at least 10 days prior to the date of the hearing and publish a notice of the Historic District Commission at least 1 time in a newspaper serving the population of Fort Smith at least 15 days prior to the hearing date.

Application is: Approved _____, Denied _____, Deferred _____

Reason for approval, denial or deferral:

Signature of Historic District Chair

Date Action Taken

Date of Issuance





514





**FORT SMITH HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MAY 2, 2024, 5:30 P.M.
DARBY COMMUNITY CENTER, 220 NORTH 7TH STREET**

STAFF REPORT

- A. Historic Name: Edgar Brown Jr. House Owner: Luis Ibarra
- Construction Date: c. 1895 Style Influence: Queen Anne/Eastlake
- Address: 515 North 5th Street Significance: (1) Very Significant
- Repair and replace front porch, steps, and walkway.

WALKWAY

FINDING:

Section 2.5.2 of the Belle Grove Historic District Design Guidelines recommends that if replacement of a section of a historic walkway, drive or parking area is required, it should be replaced with materials matching or compatible with existing materials.

Section 2.1.5 of the Belle Grove Historic District Design Guidelines recommends if repair or construction work in the public right-of-way is necessary, protect and retain historic features such as stone curbing, gutters, and street plantings. Replace in kind any damaged or deteriorated historic features. Repair or replace sidewalks, curbs, and paving, where needed, to match adjacent historic materials in design, color, module, pattern, texture, and tooling. Section 2.1.6 of the BGHD also recommends maintaining historic driveways and curb cuts.

RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the Belle Grove Historic District Design Guidelines, staff recommends approval contingent upon prior discussion with the applicant that the only change being made is extending the walkway to line up with the porch steps.

PORCH/ENTRANCE

FINDING:

Section 3.8.6 of the Belle Grove Historic District Design Guidelines recommends against removing or radically changing entrances, porches, or balconies which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished. Section 3.8.7 of the BGHD recommends against stripping entrances, porches or balconies of historic material such as wood, cast iron, terra cotta tile, and brick.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approval is contingent based upon staff discussion with the applicant that the only change will be adding a 3rd step to the porch.

**FORT SMITH HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MAY 2, 2024, 5:30 P.M.
DARBY COMMUNITY CENTER, 220 NORTH 7TH STREET**

STAFF REPORT

- A. Nombre Histórico: Edgar Brown Jr. House Dueño: Luis Ibarra
- Fecha de Construcción: c. 1895 Influencias de estilo: Reina Ana/ Victoriana
- Dirección: 515 North 5th Street Significado: (1) Significado Alto
- Reparar and reemplazar porche delantero, escaleras, y pasarela.

PASARELA

ENCUENTROS:

Sección 2.5.2 del Guía de Diseño Histórico de Belle Grove recomienda que, si reemplazo de una pasarela histórica, área de manejo o estacionamiento es requerido, debe ser reemplazado con materiales iguales o compatibles con los materiales existentes.

Sección 2.5.2 del Guía de Diseño Histórico de Belle Grove recomienda que, si reparación o trabajo de construcción en paso de público es necesario, se protege y retiene características históricas como acera de piedra, canaletas, plantaciones callejeras. Reemplazar cualquier características dañadas o deterioradas. Reparar aceras, curvas, pavimentación, adonde sea necesario, igual en materiales históricos adyacentes al deseno, color, modelo, adorno, textura, y estampación. Sección 2.1.6 de BGHD también recomienda mantenimiento de caminos de entrada y cortes de quemadura.

RECOMMENDACION:

Basado al Guía de Diseño Histórico de Belle Grove, personal recomienda aprobación contingente a una discusión previa con el aplicante que el único cambio que será hecho es extender la pasarela en línea con las escaleras.

PORCHE/ENTRADA

FINDING:

Sección 3.8.6 del Guía de Diseño Histórico de Belle Grove recomienda contra quitando o cambiando radicalmente las entradas, porches, o balcones que son importantes en la definición del carácter histórico en general del edificio, que resulta, en que esta disminuido el carácter. Sección 3.8.7 de BGHD recomienda contra desmontajes de entradas, porches, o balcones de material histórico como madera, hierro fundido, azulejo de terracota, y ladrillo.

RECOMMENDACION:

Aprobación contingente a la discusión del personal con el aplicante, que el único cambio hecho va a ser agregando un tercer paso a el porche.